

## Book Review

---

Sikandar Hayat, *The Charismatic Leader: Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah and the Creation of Pakistan*

Oxford University Press, 2014

Price: PKR 1595/- - PP. 520

Reviewed by: Prof. Dr. Saeed Shafqat (FC College University, Lahore)

---

In the last four decades, particularly after the break-up of Pakistan in 1971, different interpretations have emerged on the creation of Pakistan. Some have argued that the place was 'insufficiently imagined', another claims it was used as 'bargaining counter' to maximise concessions from the colonial ruler; others have equated its birth with 'shameful flight' of the British and yet other scholars are still trying to 'making sense of Pakistan'. While a more recent study has characterised the creation of Pakistan as 'Muslim Zion'-- calling the 'rejection of old land for the new', fallaciously equating the creation of Pakistan with the making of Israel. The questions on the nature, origins and circumstances of Pakistan's birth have also roused considerable interest on the role and leadership of Jinnah- the founder and creator of Pakistan.

Most of these studies have looked at Jinnah as some kind of passive by-stander; whether he is portrayed as 'savior', or driven by personal ambition to be the 'sole spokesman' of Indian Muslims, or because there was a 'vacuum' and dearth of leaders, hence Jinnah could emerge as filler or the hostility of the Indian National Congress and Mohandas K. Gandhi, that prompted his rise. It is ironic and sad that, until 1993, the first volume of his collected papers could not be published; in Pakistan itself many continue to see Jinnah, as 'uncomfortable father of the nation'. Patrick French has incisively remarked that neither Indians nor Pakistanis seem keen to claim him as a 'real human being'; Pakistanis have confined him to 'an appearance on the bank notes in demure Islamic costumes'... his achievement, howsoever, 'flawed it may be, was phenomenal.'

Dr. Sikandar Hayat, in an updated and revised edition of his book, *The Charismatic Leader: Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah and the Creation of Pakistan* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2014) challenges these explanations and interpretations and draws attention towards the centrality of Jinnah as 'the Charismatic Leader', who with a commitment of purpose, integrity, dedication and unflinching support from his followers, at the most critical juncture in the

history of Indian Muslims offered the 'formula of a separate state' that led to the creation of Pakistan. In other words, creation of Pakistan is neither the doing of the British nor a gift of Grace, as many seem to believe. He also dismisses the notion that Jinnah used the idea of a separate state as a 'bargaining counter' to seek concessions from the colonial rulers. Dr. Hayat brings persuasive arguments and evidence together to make us believe that during the distressful period of 1920s, and 30's for the Indian Muslims, Jinnah, was man of the moment; principled and determined, a man with a mission, who had a clear vision, a sense of purpose and who knew how to accomplish it.

Dr. Hayat makes a persuasive effort to recast, re-imagine, re-interpret the history of Pakistan Movement (1937-47) and the studies on Jinnah's leadership by center-staging him as the 'Charismatic Leader', who was visionary, had an eye on the goal and pursued a strategy slowly and peacefully with dedication, determination and personal devotion to the cause. Of course, this phase of Pakistan's history is well researched and studied but leadership of Jinnah has begun to attract scholars only recently. Why Jinnah mattered then? Why is he relevant today and for times to come? How studying his leadership is vital for understanding the adversarial circumstances under which he provided not only hope but a concrete formula to the dismayed and distressed Muslims of undivided India. Dr. Hayat has been researching and refining the concept and theory of charismatic leadership for over two decades and in the process he provides a refreshing and insightful analysis of the final phase of Pakistan Movement.

In focusing on charismatic leadership of Jinnah, Dr. Hayat makes three important contributions in refining, synthesizing and expanding the theory of charismatic leadership; first, connecting charisma with institutionalization, second, dispelling the notion that charismatic leadership is always/ mostly irrational, he highlights the rational dimensions of charisma, third, synthesizing personal attributes of leadership with situational circumstances. All three contributions resonate and could be instructive for leaders and political parties in contemporary Pakistan.

I have found five chapters in his book of particular interest and theoretically and conceptually enlightening (chapters 1, 3, 4, 5 and 7). In the first chapter, Dr. Hayat takes readers into confidence by explaining what charismatic leadership is and why Jinnah excels as a charismatic leader? Like many other scholars he also starts with the original source—Max Weber, who defined, conceptualized and theorized the relevance and need of the charismatic leader.

Operationalizing the concept of charismatic leadership through the lens of Weber, Dr. Hayat goes beyond it and weaves the arguments of Ann Ruth Willner, David Apter, Robert Tucker and Dankwart Rustow to point out the extraordinary qualities of his leadership and how such a leader is able to inspire ordinary

citizens to follow his calling and they exalt him. Charismatic leader has 'prophetic qualities', integrity, compassion, commitment of purpose and who is able to evoke devotion among his followers. A charismatic leader has emotional appeal among his followers, who bond, listen and follow the leader with devotion. These are extraordinary and rare qualities, which establish an unbreakable bond between the leader and the follower, thus charisma is as much a function of personal attributes but also follower-judgment and bonding with the leader. Supernatural qualities and myths abound and followers' allegiance and obedience to the charismatic leader progressively grows. According to Dr. Hayat, among the Muslim leaders during that period (see his chapters<sup>3</sup> and particularly 4 on Leadership Crisis) Jinnah, was the only leader, who had these personal qualities and could establish personal rapport with distressed Indian Muslims. Thus, Dr. Hayat insists that charisma is a function of both, 'personal' and 'situational' factors and that aptly describes Jinnah's role in the creation of Pakistan.

In that spirit, Dr. Hayat, amplifies the concept, adding that charismatic leader is sober, responsible and rational, and does have 'passions' but tempered by 'reason'. In his analysis and theorization, Jinnah emerges as the charismatic leader who steers, guides course of history and events and the decisions that he makes are ultimately the best. The masses charmed by this ability, flock around him and follow his call. Invoking Willner, Dr. Hayat reminds readers that while an ordinary leader may be respected by the followers, the charismatic leader, like Jinnah by sheer commitment of purpose, could compel his followers to act upon his commands and obey--- this becomes more meaningful when one looks at chapter 4, where Dr. Hayat has real hard time developing a typology of social elites, provincial leaders and traditional leaders and ulama, who in their own right and locality had support among followers but not the degree of devotion that Jinnah was able to solicit from the Muslim masses across regions that were to constitute Pakistan. This helps Dr. Hayat to gel personal factor with crisis situation and present a synergetic perspective on charismatic leadership of Jinnah, how through personal following he was able to rescue his followers from the crisis situation.

Dr. Hayat is conscious that the rise and fall of charismatic leader could be ephemeral depending on the 'crisis' situation and need of people at the moment (think Churchill at the end of Second World War, Nkrumah at his fall); however, he points out that Jinnah was different as he did not rely only on personal attributes but made consistent efforts to develop Muslim League as a political party—which is a hard sell. This dimension is explained and interpreted with rigour and evidence in chapter 6. In chapter 7, Dr. Hayat, highlights Jinnah's fortitude and political skills to resist Cripps and Cabinet Mission Plan through which, according to him, the British aimed to preserve the unity of India and

oppose 'Jinnah's concept of sovereign Pakistan of all the six Muslim majority provinces, that is, the Punjab, NWFP, Sind, Baluchistan, Bengal and Assam'. However, by managing and steering the factional politics of the Muslim majority provinces, Jinnah was efficacious in presenting Muslim League as the sole representative body of Muslims, and after due deliberations within the League and tough negotiations with the British he accepted the Partition Plan that paved the way for the creation of Pakistan.

In this perspective, he adds theoretical rigor by pointing out how some extraordinary leaders are able to 'routinize' charisma in a social or political institution and in case of Jinnah, Dr. Hayat argues that some of his charisma was inevitably placed in the Muslim League, as the people saw it strictly as Jinnah's party. Therefore, the attraction of a charismatic leader becomes two-fold: firstly, there is the allure of their personality, and secondly, even more tantalizing, is the favour of the social positions they can confer, perhaps upon a particularly devoted follower. In this sense, Dr. Hayat has made an enormous contribution on leadership studies. Such a perspective could rouse greater curiosity and perhaps more rigorous research on hitherto unexplored facets of Jinnah's leadership.

Dr. Hayat's up-dated and revised version stops at the creation of Pakistan in 1947, and thus invites others to reflect on Jinnah as Governor General of Pakistan, could he still be considered charismatic? May be some younger researchers and policy analysts would be tempted to test if Jinnah's charisma holds beyond the creation of Pakistan? The study offers a new angle to leadership of Jinnah and opens up fresh avenues on the subject. All those who are interested in understanding why political will, clarity of purpose, a sense of vision, mission, integrity and dedication to a cause is essential for leadership, will find the study invigorating, inviting and instructive to understand the past and charter future direction of Pakistan.